Thanks for linking those articles, that confirms the concern that a basic score map does not reveal anything particularly new.

That's an interesting point that conditioning on a previously completed throw is trivial. I think there is a solution in there, perhaps as simple as including incomplete pass attempts in the conditioning.

The question of 'the average player' or circumstance is certainly a challenge. I guess I should explain the origin of the theory I been looking to apply:

I don't know how familiar you are with baseball strategy, but the decision of whether to steal a base I think is fairly similar. Decade by decade 'conventional wisdom' has evolved as to whether attempting to steal a base is a good idea. Recently, analytics has determined an average expected outcome (in terms of number of runs scored that inning) for a team if a runner chooses to steal and succeeds, if he chooses to steal and fails, and if he chooses not to steal. This turns into a decision tree where inputting variables relating to the player's expected probability of success, we can determine whether or not he should attempt to steal. Even using values for expected outcomes averaged across all personnel grouping and circumstances, usage of this process has resulted in a standardization of stolen base strategy across MLB as it is a significant improvement over past theory.

As you describe,